

Ohio Public Employees Retirement System

January 4, 2016

Ms. Bethany Rhodes **Executive Director** Ohio Retirement Study Council 88 East Broad Street, Suite 1175 Columbus, OH 43215

Dear Director Rhodes:

Pursuant to R.C. 145.095, please find enclosed the 2015 Annual Audit Committee Report of the OPERS Retirement Board which is in the new reporting format proposed by ORSC staff. This report was reviewed with the OPERS Audit Committee during its meeting on December 15, 2015 and approved by the OPERS Retirement Board on December 16, 2015. The report documents the activities of the OPERS Internal Audit Department for 2015 including:

- Closed Audits with Recommendations
- Closed Audits with No Recommendations
- Active Audits
- Other Audit Related Activity

Also, the OPERS Audit Committee held three (3) meetings during 2015. Following is a summary of the meetings and actions taken:

Meeting Date	Meeting Summary & Action Taken
May 20, 2015	 CliftonLarsonAllen LLP, OPERS' external auditor, discussed the results of the 2014 financial statement audit including the report of management letter comments on internal controls. An executive summary of internal audit initiatives and activities occurring since December 2014 along with the status of outstanding audit recommendations was presented.
September 29, 2015	 Action: The Audit Committee reviewed, discussed and approved the 2016 Audit Plan. The proposed 2016 operating budget for Internal

Meeting Date	Meeting Summary & Action Taken
	Audit was presented.
December 15, 2015	 Action: The Audit Committee reviewed and approved the 2015 Annual Audit Committee Report to be provided to the ORSC. An executive summary of internal audit initiatives and activities occurring since May 2015 along with the status of outstanding audit recommendations was presented.

Please let us know if you need additional information.

Sincerely,

Gregory M. Januszewski) OPERS Director – Internal Audit

gjanuszews@opers.org

(614) 222-0080

Karen Carraher

OPERS Executive Director

kcarraher@opers.org

(614) 222-0011

Ohio Public Employees Retirement System 2015 Annual Audit Report

Closed Audits: Recommendations

					(Feb. 2015)	Records & Imaging	Audit Area	
						Mod.	Rating	Risk
		Recovery	Disaster	Record Retention	Segregation of Duties Access	Procedures	Scope	
The Box Tracking Application should be	Records and Imaging Management should periodically review access to the secure area and identify individuals whose access should be removed.	Help desk tickets should be assigned to appropriate Facilities Department staff when employee badges require access granted or restricted to secure areas within OPERS.	before deleting documents.	Imaging Department should ensure detailed help desk tickets are submitted	criteria and results of the 'potential duplicate SSNs' report to ensure duplicate accounts are identified and corrected.	Member Assessment Department should continue to work with IT to examine the	Recommendations	
Management agreed and will implement.	Management agreed and implemented.	Management agreed and implemented.		Management agreed and implemented.		Management agreed and will implement.	Management's Response	
No	Ύes	Ύes		Yes		No	Implemented	
December 2015	July 2015	October 2015		January 2015		March 2016	Implementation	Implementation or Target

¹ Risk Rating Levels:
High: Requires immediate attention and remediation.
Moderate (Mod.): Requires near-term attention.
Low: Improvements possible but does not require attention in immediate or near-term.

			Refunds & Low Refund System (Mar. 2015)			Risk Audit Area Rating ¹
	Financial Controls Segregation of Duties	Processing Controls	Access Application of Business Rules	Comments: None.		Scope
The Office of Process and Change Management (OPCM) should evaluate the opportunities to improve the process of unclaimed (outstanding) refund checks remaining in outstanding status indefinitely, attempts to locate the recipient are unlimited and there is no process to move the unclaimed funds to the income fund.	Program logic for creating general ledger information should be reviewed and corrected as necessary to provide accurate information.	Audit logging processes in the Refund System should be integrated into processes established for the Compass System.	The data entry screen superseded by TOPS should be restricted to view only access.	le.	reconciled to retained documents and updated to comply with the retention policy. The Office of Process and Change Management should evaluate the process of imaging documents with personally identifiable information.	Recommendations
Management agreed and will implement.	Management agreed and will implement.	Management agreed and implemented.	Management agreed and implemented.		Management agreed and implemented.	Management's Response
N _o	N _o	Yes	Yes		Yes	Implemented
December 2016	December 2015	October 2015	October 2015		June 2015	Implementation or Target Implementation

The Compliance Department should set Wanagement agriup procedures to test the accuracy of	Investment Accounting Accounting test applicable regulatory, internal policy Risk Management segregation from the Investment Risk Investment Management Risk Management segregation from the Investment Risk group.	& Derivatives (Jun. 2015) Reporting document a complete list of policy limits and guidelines they are responsible for Compliance tracking/testing.	Mod. Trade OPERS should establish an internal Risk Execution Mgt. Committee that would be co- chaired by the Enterprise Chief Risk Trade Officer and the Investment Risk Officer.	The Office of Process and Change Management (OPCM) should review the process of and evaluate the opportunities to improve the segregation of duties when the original refund check is returned to the Refunds Department and only an address change is required resulting in one employee changing the address in the system and re-mailing the original check. Comments: None.	Audit Area Rating ¹ Scope Recommendations Mana
Management agreed and implemented.	Management agreed and implemented.	Management agreed and implemented.	Management agreed and implemented.	The OPCM indicated a segregation of duties was not required since the check payee cannot be updated without verification.	Management's Response
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Implemented
April 2015	May 2015	November 2015	May 2015	N/A	Implementation

		*				Audit Area
						Risk Rating ¹
						Scope
The Compliance Department should have the responsibility of 'lifting' the restriction on the portfolio/restricted securities so they can monitor what trading activity has been completed and ensure the restrictions have been properly restored once the trading has	The Compliance Department should ensure covered persons are added to the ACA personal trading system and view the online material, non-public information training session within 30 days of becoming covered persons.	A recordkeeping system for the required documents on each over-the-counter derivative covered under the Dodd-Frank regulation should be developed and formally maintained by an appointed Division within OPERS.	OPERS should contract an outside consultant to perform a Business System Analysis to ensure that OPERS systems and processes are structured efficiently and effectively as well as to increase the level of data integrity.	The Derivatives Policy should be updated to further define a prohibited speculative strategy or trade. Once defined, the Leverage Policy and the Derivatives Policy should be reviewed for consistency.	periodic basis.	Recommendations
Management agreed and will implement.	Management agreed and implemented.	Management agreed and implemented.	Management agreed and will implement.	Management agreed and will implement.		Management's Response
No	Yes	Yes	No	No		Implemented
February 2016	May 2015	May 2015	December 2016	February 2016		Implementation or Target Implementation

		Audit Area
		Risk Rating ¹
Comments: None.		Scope
one.	been completed. In addition, the MINFI policy should be updated to reflect the opinion of Legal counsel and the restrictions that have been imposed on the trading. A Bloomberg compliance rule should be established to identify and prevent any trading of Global Bonds which could be restricted for material, non-public information. Key metrics from the Fund Management Committee (which is an Investment Division Committee) meeting materials including asset allocation analysis, upcoming cash flow projections, leverage testing results, investment policy dashboards and DB/HC cash inflow/outflow worksheets should be provided in a condensed report (flash report) to the leadership team on a biweekly basis. Investment Accounting should enter information known on traded Swaps and FX spot securities into the accounting system for proper recording on trade date (Swaps) or next day (FX spot trades). Once additional information is obtained, they can update the accounting record if changes need to be made.	Recommendations
	Management agreed and implemented. Management agreed and will implement. Management agreed and implemented.	Management's Response
	Yes No Yes	Implemented
	February 2015 May 2016	or Target Implementation

Member Knowledge Base							Employer Services (Jul. 2015)	Audit Area
							Mod.	Risk Rating ¹
Procedures Content	Comments: None		-		Segregation of Duties	Processing Controls Access	Procedures Compliance	Scope
Quality Assurance staff should document expected completion dates for resolving each priority status (high, medium, low)	1е.	A quality assurance process to periodically review a sample of issued service purchase cost statements should be established.	A process to report and verify changes manually made to payroll records for OPERS employees should be established.	The reporting capability to identify the missing contribution reports for DAS and ARP employers should be developed.	A process should be stablished to match the non-contributing list with OPERS membership records to ensure that employers have properly notified OPERS of re-employment or contractor services.	The reporting capability should be established to identify employers that have not submitted the non-contributing list to OPERS.	A process to update written procedures in a timely manner should be established.	Recommendations
Management agreed and will implement.		Management agreed and implemented.	Management agreed and implemented.	Management agreed and will implement.	Management agreed and will implement.	Management agreed and will implement.	Management agreed and implemented.	Management's Response
Yes		Yes	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Implemented
November 2015		July 2015	August 2015	December 2015	December 2015	December 2015	December 2015	Implementation or Target Implementation

		-		Audit Area (Aug. 2015)
				Risk Rating ¹
Comments: None				Scope
e.	The Content Administrator should consider updating the Knowledge Base Issue Log when issues are downgraded from their original priority status.	Organizational changes should be provided to Member Services staff prior to implementing to allow for sufficient time for training and updating of the Knowledge Base prior to receiving member inquiries.	Log. Quality Assurance staff should update the knowledge base in a timely manner for items that require new or revised information.	Recommendations issue added to the Knowledge Base Issue
	Management agreed and will implement.	Management agreed and implemented.	Management agreed and will implement.	Management's Response
	Yes	Yes	No	Implemented
	November 2015	August 2015	December 2015	Implementation or Target Implementation

Closed Audits: No Recommendations

	Incentive Compensation Award Calculations		Incentive
			Performance &
Not applicable.	Investment Performance Returns	Low	Investment
Management's Response	Scope	Rating	Audit Area
		Risk	

	Personal Devices (Jul. 2015)			1099-R Tax Reporting (Apr. 2015)	Audit Area Compensation Award Calculations for 2014 (Apr. 2015)
	Low			Low	Rating
Comments: The audit determined: accesses were approved and also disabled upon employee to accordance standards/policy; access to sensitive information via wireless networks was limited.	Policies Procedures Data Loss/Leakage	Comments: The audit determined: policies and procedures v	Timeliness of Issuing 1099-Rs	Procedures Compliance	Scope Comments: All incentive compensation awards for 2014 wer
Comments: The audit determined: accesses were approved and also disabled upon employee terminations; approved devices were configured in accordance standards/policy; access to sensitive information via wireless networks was limited.	Not applicable.	Comments: The audit determined: policies and procedures were updated/documented; 1099-Rs were accurate and issued timely.		Not applicable.	Management's Response Comments: All incentive compensation awards for 2014 were calculated and paid in accordance with the policies and procedures.

Active Audits

Qualified Excess Benefit	Audit Area
Mod.	Risk Rating
Mod. Procedures; Compliance; Processing Controls; Financial Reporting/Accounting; Access; Board Reporting	Scope
December 2015	Target Completion

February 2016	. Unauthorized Changes; Procedures; Access; Testing	Mod.	Change Management
January 2016	. Access; Security; Change Management	Mod.	Database Management
January 2016	. Procedures; Access; Processing Controls; Financial Reporting/Accounting	Mod.	Disability Benefits
			Arrangements
Target Completion	Scope Scope	Risk Rating	Audit Area

Other Audit Related Activity

	Assessment		
mainframe security.	Systems Security		Technology Security
The scope of the engagement included an assessment of the internet-facing and internal networks, web-applications and	Information	Mod.	Information
	Compliance		Compliance
Monitor and verify the implementation of investment compliance related audit recommendations.	Investment	Mod.	Investment
	Auditing		& Investments
Monthly review of various processes/indicators to identify exceptions and trends that may prompt a more detailed review.	Continuous	Low	Expenses, Benefits
Description	Subject/Project	Rating	Area
		Risk	

Composition of Audit Committee at end of reporting year (R.C. 145.095)

John Maurer, Representative for Retirees

Cinthia Sledz, Representative for Miscellaneous Employees

Chris Mabe, Representative for State Employees

Robert Blair, Department of Administrative Services

Bob Smith, Treasurer Appointed Investment Expert